

## A Comparison of the 1940 Animated Pinocchio Movie and Walt Disney Studios' 2022 Live-action Version of Pinocchio Movie

**Dzulfiqar Fickri Rosyid, Kankan Kasmana**

Desain Department of Universitas Komputer Indonesia (UNIKOM)

Jl. Dipati Ukur No.112-116, Lebakgede, Kecamatan Coblong,

Kota Bandung, Jawa Barat 40132

dzulfiqar.75321008@mahasiswa.unikom.ac.id

### ABSTRACT

Pinocchio is one of the popular classics of the Walt Disney animation industry released in 1940, the popularity of the Pinocchio series also prompted the animated film Pinocchio to be adapted into a live-action version in 2022. The movie is based on the classic novel by Carlo Collodi that tells the story of a wooden puppet named Pinocchio who wants to become a human child. There are different scenes from the 1940 version of Pinocchio and the 2022 version of Pinocchio. This adaptation process does bring changes in the meaning content when the story is adapted from animation to live-action. Based on this, this study aims to analyze changes in meaning in the 1940 animated version of Pinocchio and the 2022 live-action version of Pinocchio with a comparative method, data obtained from observation. The results of the study are that there are significant differences, in the 1940 animated version of Pinocchio scenes prioritize Pinocchio's self-transformation into a real boy through moral struggle and sacrifice, while the 2022 live-action version of Pinocchio adaptation emphasizes the emotional relationship between Pinocchio and Gepetto. The results of this research are expected to provide additional knowledge and new knowledge about film adaptation and the importance of considering changes that occur in both films and their impact on the content of meaning.

Keywords: Adegan, Animasi, Film, *Live-action*, Pinocchio

### INTRODUCTION

In the world of cinema, film acts as a communication medium that has a special meaning for society. Film is not only a tool for disseminating information, but also a means of creative expression and a place to represent the cultural values that surround it (Salsabilla, 2022). The movie Pinocchio produced by Walt Disney, both released in 1940 and 2022, basically contains a story about the journey of a wooden doll named Pinocchio, who is trying to become a real human being. This story comes from the work of Carlo Collodi and has been adapted in various media formats, including film (Walt Disney Animation Studios, 2023), this film also

## A Comparison of the 1940 Animated Pinocchio Movie and Walt Disney Studios' 2022 Live-action Version of Pinocchio Movie

---

managed to touch the hearts of the audience, especially from children, the film story contains moral messages about the importance of doing good and honesty in life (Khaerani, 2016). The movie Pinocchio in 2022, translated into a live-action movie, directed by Robert Zemekish. The live-action version of Pinocchio 2022 has a different ending from the 1940 version of Pinocchio (see Figure 1).



Figure 1 Above: A scene from the 2022 live action version of Pinocchio.

Bottom: the 1940 animated version of Pinocchio.

Source: <https://images.squarespace-cdn.com/content/v1/51b3dc8ee4b051b96ceb10de/c800edae-bea9-4e55-8022-baa992f7bd53/Screen+Shot+2022-08-29+at+11.25.05+AM.png>

This change caused various negative reactions from Pinocchio movie lovers, such as the criticism conveyed by Rachel (2022) that the 2022 Pinocchio film, visually dazzling but soulless, the meaning received is actually different from the meaning in the 1940 film in the animated version. The changes that arise not only affect the form of the story, but also the moral meaning to be conveyed. This could pose a risk of misunderstanding the message and purpose of the live-action version of Pinocchio 2022. However, in the context of film adaptation, the process of change is inevitable in changing the story from one media format to another.

The phenomenon of vehicle transfer in the realm of film, especially from animation to live-action formats, is an interesting approach in creating a blend of familiar stories with the latest technology and more realistic visual presentation. Damono (2018) says that vehicle switching is a process that involves moving or transferring from one type of "vehicle" to a different type of "vehicle". In this discussion, the "vehicle" in question refers to a work of art or media used to transfer or shift something from one place to another. The process of transferring vehicles

# A Comparison of the 1940 Animated Pinocchio Movie and Walt Disney Studios' 2022 Live-action Version of Pinocchio Movie

---

can involve various activities such as translation, or transferring from one medium of work to another. related to the transfer of vehicles, there are films that change the use of media formats from animation to live action, namely the 1940 film Pinocchio and the 2022 film Pinocchio. Research that examines the animated film Pinocchio has been discussed by Khaerani, M (2016) in his research entitled "semiotic analysis of moral messages in the animated film Pinocchio", but this research is from the field of Communication. Another research on Pinocchio film was conducted by Sri Romadhoni, 2010 in the field of Language entitled "The Use of Pinocchio Cartoon Film to Improve Students Narrative Text Writing Skill (Romadhoni, 2010). Jihan Merlina's research in 2023 in the field of English language and culture with the title "The Analysis of Positive and Negative Politeness Strategies Used By The Characters in Pinocchio (2022) Movie Script" (Merlina, 2023). There has been no other research related to the Pinocchio film that was researched from the field of Visual Communication Design, especially research in terms of visuals. Based on this, this research was conducted to analyze the differences in meaning in visualization between the Pinocchio film released in 1940 and the Pinocchio film released in 2022.

## METHOD

The comparative method is used to compare scenes in the 1940 movie Pinocchio and the 2022 movie Pinocchio. In a comparative study, several elements are selected to find relevant and significant objects to compare, whether it is a comparison between two different phenomena or contexts or two certain interrelated variables. The use of comparative methods can describe the changes that occur and explore the impact of these differences on the essence of the story that the two versions of the film want to present (Rohman, 2013). Comparative research basically aims to make a comparison between two or more facts and characteristics of the object under study in order to identify similarities and differences within a certain framework of thought (Nazir, 2005).

The data collection in this study uses observation of the movie scene at the end, starting at minute 1:21:34 for the 1940 animated version of Pinocchio and starting at minute 1:23:34 for the 2022 live-action version of Pinocchio. The scene at that minute was chosen because it is the last and crucial scene in both movies. The story in this final scene is where Pinocchio manages to save his father and prove his courage to become a real human being. The movie source is taken from <https://www.disneyanimation.com/films/pinocchio/>. The data collected based on these observations became the basis for recognizing the fundamental differences in the messages conveyed in the two films and the meaning content of these messages. In the data analysis process, the initial stage is the collection of scenes relevant to the changes seen in the final scenes of both films. Through this approach, the research is expected to find the changed scenes, the changed messages and meanings.



# A Comparison of the 1940 Animated Pinocchio Movie and Walt Disney Studios' 2022 Live-action Version of Pinocchio Movie

---

## RESULT AND DISCUSSION

### A. The 1940 Animated Version of Pinocchio Movie

The animated film "Pinocchio", released in 1940, is a 1 hour and 27 minute work. Although this movie has a stand-alone story, it still takes some reference elements from the original Pinocchio children's story written by Carlo Collodi. The animated version of Pinocchio is an American musical animated film produced by Walt Disney Production is one of the works released in 1940 released by RKO Radio Pictures (Britannica, 2023). The movie is adapted from the classic novel by Carlo Collodi. The synopsis of the story tells the story of an old Italian carpenter named Geppetto who makes a wooden doll named Pinocchio and hopes he can become a real boy. The movie also won two Academy Awards for Best Original Score and Best Original Song for the song "When You Wish Upon a Star".

### B. The 2022 Live Action Version of Pinocchio Movie





The live action adaptation of Pinocchio was released in 2022 and has a duration of 1 hour 45 minutes. This film has the exact same storyline as its animated predecessor but with different visualizations using human actors, but still using some interesting visualizations and with CGI animation effects and also some changes and additions to the story plot that are different from the animated version. The film was released for Disney+ on September 8, 2022, as part of Disney+ Day. The film was originally planned to be released in theaters in 2021, but was delayed due to the COVID-19 pandemic (Variety, 2022). Some criticism has been leveled at the movie for not being faithful to the original story. Some changes to iconic moments are among the few unnecessary changes in this adaptation, which makes fans wonder why Disney continues to remake memorable classics. Most fans of the movie thought that it was all a commercial move for a new generation (Kirsten, 2023).

### C. Comparative Study of the 1940 Animated Version of Pinocchio Movie and the 2022 Live Action Version of Pinocchio Movie

As a messaging medium, movies have several characteristics that affect the way the message is conveyed, often the goal of filmmakers is to create a work of art that conveys the desired meaning for those who watch it (Yosi, 2014). In both versions of Pinocchio, the animated version and the live-action version, there are various striking differences in the final scene. To compare the differences, this study presents a table containing some aspects that changed or remained in the final scenes of both films. The Tables (Table 1, 2, and 3) can help how these changes affect the meaning and impact of Pinocchio's story.

## A Comparison of the 1940 Animated Pinocchio Movie and Walt Disney Studios' 2022 Live-action Version of Pinocchio Movie

**Table 1** The 1940 Animated Version of Pinocchio Movie on 1:23:34-1:25:05 and The 2022 Live Action Version of Pinocchio Movie on 1:21:34 - 1:36:05

Pinocchio (1940)	Pinocchio (2022)
  <p style="text-align: center;">Minute 1:23:34-1:25:05</p>	  <p style="text-align: center;">Minute 1:21:34 - 1:36:05</p>
<p>After realizing his mistake, Pinocchio received news from the Blue Fairy through a dove that Geppetto, his father, had disappeared while he was trying to find Pinocchio.</p> <p>Then in his search Pinocchio was swallowed by the monster whale Monstro. Unexpectedly, Geppetto turns out to be in the stomach of Monstro. To escape, Pinocchio took the initiative by creating a big fire in Monstro's mouth. They managed to escape by using the cooperation between son and father. <b>From their struggle and the proof of courage they showed, Pinocchio gained the trust of the Blue Fairy. Finally, Pinocchio turns into a real boy as a reward for his kindness and willingness to be a good boy.</b></p> <p>This scene shows how through courage, cooperation, and determination, Pinocchio overcomes adversity and proves himself to be a good boy.</p>	<p>Pinocchio received news that his father was looking for him, Pinocchio with the help of his friends managed to find Geppetto in the middle of the ocean. But a giant sea creature called Monstro appears and swallows them. Then Pinocchio was trapped with his father in Monstro's mouth. Pinocchio also managed to get out of Monstro's mouth by using his wits, they managed to escape. In this tense moment, Pinocchio uses his wits to make his feet the motor of the raft used by Geppetto because Monstro continues to pursue them. In the midst of a fierce chase, they managed to escape from the Monstro but from this incident Geppetto was unconscious. Pinocchio, determined to prove his goodness and desire to be a good son, would do anything for his father. Then, by an unexpected miracle, Geppetto suddenly regains consciousness, and the two of them can go home together. The ending emphasizes the importance of Pinocchio's courage, persistence in overcoming obstacles and learning from his mistakes.</p>



## A Comparison of the 1940 Animated Pinocchio Movie and Walt Disney Studios' 2022 Live-action Version of Pinocchio Movie

---

**Table 2** Comparison The 1940 Animated Version of Pinocchio Movie on 1:23:34-1:25:05 and The 2022 Live Action Version of Pinocchio Movie on 1:21:34 - 1:36:05

Analysis	Animated	<i>Live-action</i>
<b>Scene 1 The Beginning of Gepetto Search</b>	The scene begins with Pinocchio escaping from Pleasure Island, transformed into donkey ears. At this moment, the Blue Fairy appears indirectly through a dove, providing information that Gepetto is looking for Pinocchio to the high seas controlled by the Monstro whale. Pinocchio and Jimminy Cricket prepare to search for Gepetto.	The live-action version starts the scene with Pinocchio and Jimminy Cricket trying to find Gepetto. Information about Gepetto looking for Pinocchio comes from a seagull named Sofia. However, this scene also features the presence of Fabiana and Sabina, who bring news of Stromboli's capture.
<b>Scene 2 Searching the High Seas</b>	In the animated version, Pinocchio and Jimminy Cricket search for Gepetto under the sea by diving until they find Monstro, a giant whale that eventually swallows them.	In the live-action version, Pinocchio and Jimminy Cricket are also searching for Gepetto using a raft, but with help from Sofia. They are also eventually confronted by Monstro who swallows them.
<b>Scene 3 Meeting with Gepetto inside Monstro</b>	At the climax, Pinocchio meets Gepetto inside Monstro's stomach. A happy atmosphere is depicted in this scene. Pinocchio, who has just felt the consequences of his actions, proposes a plan to escape from inside Monstro's stomach by making smoke.	In the live-action adaptation, Pinocchio also meets Gepetto inside Monstro. However, this time, Pinocchio uses the same fire as in the animated version to find a way out.
<b>Scene 4 Facing Monstro</b>	Both versions show the cooperation between Pinocchio and Gepetto in facing Monstro. In the animated movie, they work together to escape from Monstro and are blown away by the waves, until they are stranded on the beach.	Live-action: In the live-action, Pinocchio and Gepetto manage to escape from Monstro's belly. However, Pinocchio utilizes his raft to transform into a jet boat, adding an action dimension to this adaptation.
<b>Scene 5 Gepetto's concerns</b>	When the action ends, Gepetto awakens to find Pinocchio motionless. Worry and relief rolled in, with Gepetto crying and trying to wake up Pinocchio	The scene also features a moment of tension as Gepetto lies on the beach. Pinocchio tries to wake him up with the same hopes and concerns.
<b>Scene 6 Peak of Change and Happy Ending</b>	In the animated film, the Blue Fairy appears in bluish light to acknowledge Pinocchio's transformation. Gepetto is happy with the return of his son who has turned into a real boy. This scene also recognizes Jimminy Cricket's important role in Pinocchio's journey.	In the live-action version, Pinocchio sings the emotional "Wish upon the Star". Gepetto is awakened by the magic of the Blue Fairy, featuring a magical moment depicting the reunification of father and son. This scene is followed by a closing narration by Jimminy Cricket that illustrates the core message of the movie, that being human is not in looks but in heart.

## A Comparison of the 1940 Animated Pinocchio Movie and Walt Disney Studios' 2022 Live-action Version of Pinocchio Movie

---

**Table 3** Similarities and Differences and Result Analysis of Comparison The 1940 Animated Version of Pinocchio Movie on 1:23:34-1:25:05 and The 2022 Live Action Version of Pinocchio Movie on 1:21:34 - 1:36:05

<b>Similarities</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Both versions feature Pinocchio's efforts to find Gepetto.</li> <li>● Monstro remains a crucial element in both adaptations.</li> <li>● Both convey the message of the importance of change in behavior.</li> <li>● Emotional moments between Pinocchio and Gepetto are well conveyed between the two films.</li> </ul>
<b>Differences</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The start of the live-action scene, faced with a new character who invites Pinocchio to join the puppet show</li> <li>● Gepetto's news message delivered by a different source</li> <li>● Different details of Gepetto's search</li> <li>● Actions taken by Pinocchio and Gepetto in dealing with Monstro.</li> <li>● In the animated version, Pinocchio is unconscious, but in the live-action it is Gepetto who is unconscious.</li> </ul>

Through this analysis, it can be understood that the comparison between the animated film "Pinocchio" (1940) and the live-action adaptation "Pinocchio" (2022) produced by Walt Disney, there are significant differences in the scene. The animated version prioritizes Pinocchio's self-transformation into a real boy through moral struggle and sacrifice, while the live-action adaptation puts emphasis on the emotional relationship between Pinocchio and Gepetto, which makes it interesting that their positions are made as if they were reversed. In the animation Pinocchio is the one who is unconscious, but in the live-action version it is Gepetto who is unconscious. The absence of the Blue Fairy's role in the live-action adaptation adds a new dimension to the moral message of acceptance and love, while the final dialogue that invites audience interpretation leads to personal reflection on the character's transformation. This comparison shows how changes in story presentation and nuance can give different interpretations to the moral messages carried by the movie.

While in the live-action version, the meaning in the moral message is more implied and interpersonal. The Blue Fairy's less prominent presence is replaced by new characters such as Fabiana and Sabina who provide support to Pinocchio in his journey and growth. The meaning of the moral message here emphasizes that being a true human being is not only about physical appearance, but also about inner nature and a good heart.

This analysis shows how decisions to change the storyline can affect the meaning received by the audience, demonstrating the flexibility and complexity of film adaptation in conveying strong moral messages and influencing how the audience perceives and interprets the messages conveyed.



## A Comparison of the 1940 Animated Pinocchio Movie and Walt Disney Studios' 2022 Live-action Version of Pinocchio Movie

---

### CONCLUSION

Through a comparative analysis of the final scene between the 1940 animated version of Pinocchio and the 2022 live action version of Pinocchio produced by Walt Disney, the data obtained are; in the 1940 animated version of Pinocchio, the moral message conveyed is more explicit and authoritative, with characters such as the Blue Fairy who acts as a direct moral messenger to Pinocchio. While in the 2022 live-action version of Pinocchio, the meaning in the moral message is more implicit and interpersonal. The Blue Fairy's less prominent presence is replaced by new characters such as Fabiana and Sabina who provide support to Pinocchio in his journey and growth.

This comparison provides a deeper insight into how the culminating moment of the story is treated in the two movie versions, and the impact of these changes on the overall meaning of the story. There is a change in the way the moral message is conveyed in both versions. While the basic structure of both versions of the movie is the same, with Pinocchio and Gepetto trying to save each other from Monstro, the significant differences in storytelling give each movie a distinctive feel. The live-action adaptation process brought about a number of changes in the storyline and characters, which directly or indirectly affected the atmosphere and meaning of the final scene. The presence of additional characters like Fabiana and Sabina in the live-action adaptation adds a layer of complexity to the narrative. There remains a strong moral message about the importance of good intentions and behavioral change in both versions of the film.

While the moral message conveyed in the final scene remains consistent across both adaptations, which is about the importance of behavioral change and goodwill, as well as the relationship between parents and children, the way it is delivered and the details of its execution differ between the animated and live-action versions. All of this analysis illustrates how film adaptations can utilize visual elements, narrative, and structural changes to provide unique and interesting interpretations of the same story. These differences create a different experience for the audience in re-experiencing a familiar story, while still maintaining the same moral essence. As such, this comparative analysis highlights how important it is to recognize how film adaptations can change and influence the way we understand the story and the meaning the filmmakers want to convey to the audience.



# A Comparison of the 1940 Animated Pinocchio Movie and Walt Disney Studios' 2022 Live-action Version of Pinocchio Movie

---

## REFERENCE

- Britannica. (n.d.). Pinocchio | Movie, Disney, Plot, Characters, & Facts. November 24, 2023, from <https://www.britannica.com/topic/Pinocchio-film-1940>
- Damono (2018) *Alih Wahana*. Gramedia Pustaka Utama
- Kirsten. (2022). *Disney's 'Pinocchio' Live Action: Cast, Release Date, & More To Know About The Remake*. <https://hollywoodlife.com/feature/disney-pinocchio-live-action-4601574/>
- Maulidah Khaerani, (2016) Analisis Semiotik Pesan Moral Dalam Film Animasi Pinocchio, Program Studi Komunikasi Dan Penyiaran Islam Fakultas Ilmu Dakwah Dan Ilmu Komunikasi Universitas Islam Negeri Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta
- Nazir, Moh. 2005. Metode Penelitian. Jakarta: Ghalia Indonesia
- Rohman, A. (2013). Pendidikan Komparatif: Dasar-Dasar Teori Perbandingan Pendidikan Antar Bangsa. Yogyakarta: Aswaja Pressindo. Ngaglik, Sleman
- Salsabila, R. (2022). Analisis Konsep Diri dalam Film "I'm Thinking of Ending Things". Makassar: Departemen Ilmu Komunikasi, Fakultas Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik, Universitas Hasanuddin
- Pinocchio (Film), (2023). The Disney Official Fan Club. Diakses dari <https://d23.com/>
- Rachel. (2022). *PINOCCHIO 2022 OR CAN I WISH TO HAVE NOT SEEN THIS FILM?* <https://rachelsreviews.net/2022/09/08/review-pinocchio-2022-or-can-i-wish-to-have-not-seen-this-film/>
- Rohman, A. (2013). *Pendidikan Komparatif: Dasar-Dasar Teori Perbandingan Pendidikan Antar Bangsa*. Yogyakarta: Aswaja Pressindo. Ngaglik, Sleman
- Variety. (2022). 'Pinocchio' Live-Action Remake Premiere Date Set on Disney+., <https://variety.com/2022/film/news/pinocchio-premiere-date-disney-plus-1235281371/>
- Walt Disney Animation Studios. (2023). Pinocchio. <https://www.disneyanimation.com/films/pinocchio/>
- Wikiwand. (2023, November 23). Pinocchio (1940 film). November 24, 2023, from [https://www.wikiwand.com/en/Pinocchio %281940 film%29](https://www.wikiwand.com/en/Pinocchio_%281940_film%29)
- Yosi, S. (2014) *FILM SEBAGAI MEDIA KOMUNIKASI MASSA*. <https://www.e-jurnal.com/2014/01/film-sebagai-media-komunikasi-massa.html>

